



House of Commons  
Defence Committee

---

# The work of the Committee 2007–08

---

**Second Report of Session 2008–09**

*Report, together with formal minutes*

*Ordered by the House of Commons  
to be printed 16 December 2008*

**HC 106**

Published on 14 January 2009  
by authority of the House of Commons  
London: The Stationery Office Limited  
£0.00

## The Defence Committee

The Defence Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Ministry of Defence and its associated public bodies.

### Current membership

Rt Hon James Arbuthnot MP (*Conservative, North East Hampshire*) (Chairman)  
Mr David S Borrow MP (*Labour, South Ribble*)  
Mr David Crausby MP (*Labour, Bolton North East*)  
Linda Gilroy MP (*Labour, Plymouth Sutton*)  
Mr David Hamilton MP (*Labour, Midlothian*)  
Mr Mike Hancock MP (*Liberal Democrat, Portsmouth South*)  
Mr Dai Havard MP (*Labour, Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney*)  
Mr Adam Holloway MP (*Conservative, Gravesham*)  
Mr Bernard Jenkin MP (*Conservative, North Essex*)  
Mr Brian Jenkins MP (*Labour, Tamworth*)  
Mr Kevan Jones MP (*Labour, Durham North*)  
Robert Key MP (*Conservative, Salisbury*)  
John Smith MP (*Labour, Vale of Glamorgan*)  
Richard Younger-Ross MP (*Liberal Democrat, Teignbridge*)

The following Members were also Members of the Committee during the Parliament.

Mr Colin Breed MP (*Liberal Democrat, South East Cornwall*)  
Derek Conway MP (*Conservative, Old Bexley and Sidcup*)  
Mr Mark Lancaster MP (*Conservative, North East Milton Keynes*)  
Willie Rennie MP (*Liberal Democrat, Dunfermline and West Fife*)  
Mr Desmond Swayne MP (*Conservative, New Forest West*)

### Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the Internet via [www.parliament.uk](http://www.parliament.uk).

### Publications

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the Internet at: [www.parliament.uk/defcom](http://www.parliament.uk/defcom)

### Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Mike Hennessy (Clerk), Richard Ward (Second Clerk), Ian Rogers (Audit Adviser), Richard Dawson (Senior Committee Assistant), Christine McGrane (Committee Assistant) and Stewart McIlvenna (Committee Support Assistant).

### Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Defence Committee, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 5745; the Committee's email address is [defcom@parliament.uk](mailto:defcom@parliament.uk). Media inquiries should be addressed to Alex Paterson on 020 7219 1589.

# Contents

---

<b>Report</b>	<i>Page</i>
<b>Summary</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2 Core Tasks and inquiries</b>	<b>6</b>
Examination of Government and European Commission policy proposals	6
UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty	6
Arms Export Controls	6
Examination of emerging and deficient policy	7
Current operations	7
The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned	8
Medical care for the Armed Forces	8
The future of NATO and European defence	9
Defence Equipment 2008	9
Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	10
The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability	10
UK national security and resilience	10
Examination of legislation and of specific output from the Department	11
Examination of Departmental expenditure	11
Examination of Public Service Agreements and targets	12
Scrutiny of Agencies and other associated public bodies	13
Scrutiny of major appointments	13
Examination of implementation of legislation and policy initiatives	14
Production of reports for debate	14
<b>3 Working Practices and Innovation</b>	<b>15</b>
Extending our range of witnesses	15
Webfora	15
Publication of evidence on the internet	15
Seminars	16
Inward visits	16
Outward visits	16
Political engagement within Europe	17
Petitions	17
Specialist Advisers	17
<b>4 Departmental Responses</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>5 Looking Ahead</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Conclusions and recommendations</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>Annex 1: Core Tasks Fulfilled</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Annex 2: Sessional Information</b>	<b>22</b>

<b>Annex 3: Oral Evidence Sessions</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Annex 4: Informal Meetings</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>Formal minutes</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament</b>	<b>35</b>

## Summary

---

This Report describes the work of the Defence Committee in the 2007-08 Session. It illustrates how—in carrying out its work of scrutinising the Ministry of Defence (MoD) and associated public bodies—it has met the core tasks recommended to select committees by the Liaison Committee.

The Committee's last such Report described its work in 2007. In making the transition from an annual to a sessional Report, there has been an unavoidable overlap in reporting periods, with last year's Report and this both covering the latter part of 2007.

The Report highlights aspects of the Committee's working practices which depart from previous practice or which may otherwise be of particular interest. It draws specific attention to the Committee's findings during its inquiry into the Iran hostages incident, and its visit to Iraq and the Gulf in June. The Committee continues to underline the importance of visits to the Armed Forces on operational deployment. The Report also highlights the webforums held during its inquiries into *Medical care for the Armed Forces* and *Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel*.

The Report draws attention to the Committee's horizon-scanning seminar in October, during which it discussed its working practices and programme for 2008-09, including its decision to utilise the MoD's Balanced Scorecard to help plot future inquiries.

# 1 Introduction

---

1. This Report describes the work of the Defence Committee in Session 2007-08.
2. In 2007-08, we continued to seek a balance in our inquiries between those dealing with the policy outputs of the Ministry of Defence (MoD), the expenditure of the Department—including on defence equipment—and operational deployments. Those deployments lend focus to this Report as they do to our work. While they continue, these Reports will maintain a clear operational focus.

## 2 Core Tasks and inquiries

---

3. This part of our report describes how we sought to cover each of the core tasks recommended by the Liaison Committee. A table summarising this can be found at Annex 1.

### Examination of Government and European Commission policy proposals

4. The Liaison Committee's Core Task 1 encourages us to scrutinise policy proposals from the UK Government and the European Commission in the form of Green Papers, White Papers, draft Guidance etc, and to inquire further where we consider appropriate.

### *UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty*

5. As a Committee, we have had a longstanding interest in defence cooperation with our allies. In June 2007, the Prime Minister and the US President signed the UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty. Published in September 2007, the Treaty established a framework for defence trade cooperation between the United Kingdom and the United States of America.<sup>1</sup> Although treaties are ratified by the Government under the Royal Prerogative, rather than by Parliament, treaties are laid before Parliament for 21 sitting days (by Government undertaking the 'Ponsonby rule') before ratification to enable Parliament to consider and comment on them. **At our request, the Government extended the period of time available to Parliament to scrutinise the UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty. This allowed us to conduct an inquiry into the Treaty. We are grateful to the Government for this flexibility.** In November 2007 we took evidence from defence companies as well as the MoD and the Cabinet Office and published our report in December 2007 which recommended early ratification of the Treaty.<sup>2</sup>

### *Arms Export Controls*

6. In 2007-08, we continued our contribution to the Committees on Arms Export Controls (formerly the 'Quadripartite' Committee), together with Members from the Foreign Affairs, Business, Enterprise and Regulatory Reform, and International Development Committees. The Committees carry out detailed scrutiny of the Government's controls on exports of equipment and technology with a military application. In July 2008 they produced a Report on the scrutiny of Arms Export Controls.<sup>3</sup>

7. The Committees concluded that the Government should make it illegal for British citizens overseas, as well as everyone living in the UK, to trade in any form of arms or

---

1 Treaty between the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and the Government of the United States of America concerning defence trade cooperation: London and Washington, 21 and 26 June 2007, Cm 7213, September 2007

2 Defence Committee, Third Report of Session 2007-08, *UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty*, HC 107

3 Defence Committee, Twelfth Report (First Joint Report of the Committees on Arms Export Controls) of Session 2007-08, *Scrutiny of Arms Export Controls (2008): UK Strategic Export Controls Annual Report 2006, Quarterly Reports for 2007, licensing policy and review of export control legislation*, HC 254

weaponry between overseas countries without a licence. The Committees also urged the Government, in completing its Review of Export Controls, to extend its existing rule covering the trade of certain “high risk” items to all goods and technologies on UK’s Military List, which covers military, security and para-military goods, software and technology and arms ammunition and related material.<sup>4</sup>

## Examination of emerging and deficient policy

8. Core Task 2 encourages us to scrutinise Government policy and to identify where a Committee inquiry would be worthwhile.

### Current operations

9. In our First Report of the Session on *UK land operations in Iraq* we welcomed the apparent improvement in the security situation following the surge of US Forces and we noted the dramatic reduction of violence in the UK area of operations in South Eastern Iraq. However, we warned that there had been no corresponding reduction in the number of attacks on the civilian population and that, although improved, the security situation continued to cause concern. We said that the development of the Iraqi Security Forces was fundamental to the long-term security of Iraq and to the drawdown and eventual withdrawal of UK Forces. While there had been progress in improving the performance of the Iraqi Army, the police remained a source of deep and continuing concern. We noted the Prime Minister’s announcement that the Government planned, from the Spring of 2008, to reduce UK Forces in Iraq to 2,500 but said that important questions remained about the sustainability of a force of this size. We also said that unless UK Forces in Iraq were capable of doing more than simply protecting themselves at Basra Air Station, the entire UK presence in South Eastern Iraq would be open to question.<sup>5</sup>

10. We published an additional Report on the situation in Iraq and the Gulf in July.<sup>6</sup> Our Report was published soon after we had visited Iraq in June as part of our regular programme of scrutiny of the UK’s major overseas operational deployments. It was based principally on what we had seen during the visit. We found the security situation in Basra transformed. There had been an obvious and substantial improvement in security and it seemed clear to us that it was largely the result of the success of Operation Charge of the Knights, the Iraqi-led effort to break the control of the militias in Basra. Due to our concern that the House and wider public were not necessarily aware of the very positive developments which we undoubtedly saw in Iraq, we decided to agree a Report drawing attention to them.

---

4 Defence Committee, Twelfth Report (First Joint Report of the Committees on Arms Export Controls) of Session 2007-08, *Scrutiny of Arms Export Controls (2008): UK Strategic Export Controls Annual Report 2006, Quarterly Reports for 2007, licensing policy and review of export control legislation*, HC 254

5 Defence Committee, First Report of Session 2007-08, *UK land operations in Iraq 2007*, HC 110

6 Defence Committee, Fifteenth Report of Session 2007-08, *UK operations in Iraq and the Gulf*, HC 982

### *The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned*

11. In March 2007, 15 Royal Navy personnel from HMS Cornwall—a Royal Navy Frigate, deployed with the Coalition Task Force in the Northern Gulf—were captured by the Iranian Revolutionary Guard while conducting a boarding operation on a merchant vessel in shallow waters near the mouth of the Shatt al-Arab waterway, between Iraq and Iran. They were taken to Iran and detained until early April 2007. In mid-April the Secretary of State for Defence announced that he had appointed Lieutenant General Sir Rob Fulton RM (retired) to inquire into the operational circumstances and factors leading to the capture of the Royal Navy personnel. He said that, because the inquiry would consider operationally sensitive material, it would not be possible to publish all of the conclusions, but that they would be presented to the Defence Committee in full.

12. We undertook an inquiry into the incident, *The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned*. **Unusually, because of the classified nature of the material presented to us, we had to conduct our evidence sessions for our inquiry into *The Iran hostages incident* in private. We had some reservations about conducting scrutiny on terms of the Government's choosing.**

13. Our inquiry sought: to scrutinise the Fulton Report on behalf of the House of Commons and to establish whether it was comprehensive and its recommendations sufficient; to ensure that the MoD's related action plan was adequate and properly implemented and resourced; to scrutinise the Hall report into the sale of the stories of the Royal Navy personnel to the press upon their release; and to ensure that the lessons of the HMS Cornwall incident had been fully learned and disseminated. Our Report was published in December 2007.<sup>7</sup>

14. We found the MoD's initial response to our inquiry to be inadequate, and sensed that the Department had not anticipated that we would pursue an inquiry in depth. Noting our persistence, the MoD eventually responded positively and was helpful in providing full answers to our questions in writing and in offering high level briefing. **We concluded that the Fulton Report, and the evidence provided to us in support of it, contained a depth of operational detail which it would have been damaging to have made public. This made it difficult for us to demonstrate openly the grounds on which we reached our conclusions. In our Report, we assured the House that we had scrutinised the Fulton Report thoroughly and we wrote to the Secretary of State for Defence with a number of classified conclusions and recommendations.**

### *Medical care for the Armed Forces*

15. We published our Report on *Medical care for the Armed Forces* in February.<sup>8</sup> We focussed on three main issues: healthcare for Service personnel, both at home and overseas, and the arrangements for those returning from overseas postings; medical support for operations, including the treatment of injured personnel—from immediate treatment in the theatre of operations to after-care in the UK—and the facilities provided for them; and

7 Defence Committee, Fourth Report of Session 2007-08, *The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned*, HC 181

8 Defence Committee, Seventh Report of Session 2007-08, *Medical care for the Armed Forces*, HC 327

how medical services for the Armed Forces are delivered, in particular how the MoD engages with the NHS to provide healthcare. We held a webforum during our inquiry, further details of which are provided in paragraph 48.

16. In our Report, we paid tribute to the world-class clinical care provided to Service personnel by Defence Medical Services working with the NHS, and encouraged the MoD to continue the improvements at the Royal Centre for Defence Medicine in Birmingham. The DMS's rehabilitation services, especially at Headley Court, are exceptional and contribute enormously to the welfare of Service personnel. We concluded that the delivery of care through the MoD, NHS, and charities and welfare organisations worked well. However, we also concluded that more needed to be done to address the sharing of best practice between the DMS and the NHS.

17. We also raised concerns over the provision of services to Armed Forces personnel in Scotland where we found such provision inadequate. We concluded that the MoD and the Scottish Executive must review the structures through which they engaged with other departments and administrations and look at how improvements could be made. We also paid tribute to the role that Reserve personnel played in the delivery of military healthcare.

### ***The future of NATO and European defence***

18. In March we published our Report on *the future of NATO and European defence* ahead of the NATO Summit to be held in Bucharest in April.<sup>9</sup> Our intention in holding this inquiry was to provide a comprehensive analysis of the current state of the Atlantic Alliance. We concluded that NATO remains an indispensable Alliance and must maintain its position at the heart of UK and European defence policy. We warned that it faces severe threats to its credibility and cohesion, most notably from a lack of political will to support it in its member countries. We also warned that succeeding in Afghanistan must remain at the top of NATO's agenda. Furthermore, the burden in Afghanistan is not shared equitably and other nations should contribute more.

### ***Defence Equipment 2008***

19. We also conducted our annual inquiry into *Defence Equipment*.<sup>10</sup> We commended the MoD's Defence Equipment and Support (DE&S) organisation for the speed at which it was getting urgently needed equipment to UK Armed Forces on current operations. We highlighted a number of concerns about the acquisition of defence equipment including further in-service date slippage and cost increases on a number of key equipment programmes. We were disappointed to learn that Joint Strike Fighter (JSF) aircraft would not be available to operate from the first new aircraft carrier when it was due in service in 2014.<sup>11</sup> We stressed the need for the MoD to take the difficult decisions which will lead to a realistic and affordable equipment programme. This might mean cutting whole equipment programmes rather than just delaying orders or making cuts to the number of platforms ordered across a range of programmes.

---

9 Defence Committee, Ninth Report of Session 2007-08, *The future of NATO and European defence*, HC 111

10 Defence Committee, Tenth Report of Session 2007-08, *Defence Equipment 2008*, HC 295

11 This has now been overtaken by the recent announcement on the delay of the aircraft carriers.

### ***Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel***

20. In July we published our Report on *Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel*.<sup>12</sup> In particular, we wanted to examine the factors which hamper recruitment to the Armed Forces, and identify what the MoD was doing to improve recruitment; examine the difficulties the Armed Forces had in retaining personnel, and identify what the MoD was doing to improve retention; and to examine the recruitment and retention of reservists. We also held a webforum which provided first-hand comments from Service personnel about the problems they face: further details of this webforum are provided in paragraph 48.

21. We concluded that the MoD was not responding with sufficient flexibility and imagination to the problems it faces relating to the recruitment and retention of Armed Forces personnel. We recognised the important effect of the state of the economy and public opinion upon trends in recruitment but stressed the importance of the MoD working harder to recruit people to those particular trades which were currently seriously undermanned. As it costs less for the MoD to retain than to recruit and train a member of the Armed Forces, we also felt that not enough emphasis was being placed on ways of improving the retention of personnel. In particular, more needed to be done with regard to health care and social and affordable housing.

### ***The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability***

22. We published a Report on *The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability*.<sup>13</sup> Intelligence, Surveillance, Target Acquisition and Reconnaissance (ISTAR) is a key military capability and is fundamental to Network Enabled Capability (NEC). Unmanned Aerial Vehicles (UAVs) have emerged as an important means of collecting ISTAR information. We concluded that the MoD had been perhaps slow to appreciate the potential of UAVs, but now recognises the important contribution they can make. The UAVs acquired for current operations are proving very effective in collecting ISTAR information. However, improvements are required particularly in how this information is processed and disseminated.

### ***UK national security and resilience***

23. The Committee decided in January to inquire into the Ministry of Defence's contribution to the broad spectrum of UK national security and resilience issues. This was in the context of the then-impending publication of a cross-departmental national security strategy and the review, headed by the Rt Hon Adam Ingram MP, former Armed Forces Minister, of the UK's military response to terrorism, to which the Government has now responded.<sup>14</sup>

24. In March, the Government published *The National Security Strategy of the United Kingdom: Security in an interdependent world* (NSS). Although the publication was

---

12 Defence Committee, Fourteenth Report of Session 2007-08, *Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel*, HC 424

13 Defence Committee, Thirteenth Report of Session 2007-08, *The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability*, HC 535

14 HC Deb, 8 December 2008, cols 26-27WS

coordinated by the Cabinet Office, the Strategy stated its aim as being “to set out how we will address and manage this diverse though interconnected set of security challenges and underlying drivers”.<sup>15</sup> Chapter 4 of the NSS deals in part with the contribution of the Armed Forces to the overarching security policy of the UK.

25. Our inquiry is still underway. We have, so far, taken oral evidence from industry, the Ministry of Defence, the Home Office, and the Cabinet Office. We have received a classified copy of Mr Ingram’s final report to the Prime Minister, and very much hope to arrange a private briefing from Mr Ingram in the near future and take further oral evidence.

## Examination of legislation and of specific output from the Department

26. The Liaison Committee’s Core Task 3 calls for committees to conduct scrutiny on any published draft Bill within its responsibilities. Core Task 4 calls for us to develop a framework for being informed of secondary legislation, circulars and guidance, treaties and previously identified casework decisions, so that they can be drawn to our attention where necessary. The MoD has presented no draft primary legislation to Parliament since July 2005. The MoD has provided us with copies of all secondary legislation laid. We have in place a system of scrutiny, by which occasional bulletins are put before us summarising the secondary legislation laid and alerting us to matters of significance. We continue to take a particular interest in the implementation of the provisions of the Armed Forces Act 2006 which is carried out by means of secondary legislation.

## Examination of Departmental expenditure

27. Core Task 5 calls for committees to develop a systematic framework for committee scrutiny of the Department’s Main and Supplementary Estimates, its expenditure plans and its annual accounts.

28. Following our usual practice, we reported on the Winter Supplementary Estimate 2007-08, the Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007-08, and the Main Estimates 2008-09, in each case before the House of Commons was invited to agree the Estimates.<sup>16</sup> In this task, we have received valuable assistance from the Committee Office Scrutiny Unit. As we noted last year, the MoD’s Supplementary Estimates have been of particular interest since they used to be the first to reveal the cost of military operations, which have traditionally not been covered in the Main Estimates. On account of our insistence, this cost will, from 2009-10, be included in some detail in the Main Estimate. A number of our other requests, asking for additional information, have also been agreed.

29. In addition to our scrutiny of the Estimates, we have held an annual inquiry into the MoD’s Resource Accounts, as set out in the Departmental Annual Report and Accounts. In

---

15 Cabinet Office, *The National Security Strategy of the United Kingdom: Security in an interdependent world*, Cm 7921, March 2008

16 Defence Committee, Second Report of Session 2007-08, *Costs of operations in Iraq and Afghanistan: Winter Supplementary Estimate 2007-08*, HC 138; Eighth Report of Session 2007-08, *Operational costs in Afghanistan and Iraq: Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007-08*, HC 400; Defence Committee, Eleventh Report of Session 2007-08, *Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2008-09*, HC 885.

this task we were assisted by the National Audit Office (NAO), which produced an analysis of the MoD's Annual Report and Accounts for our inquiry.<sup>17</sup> In November 2007 we took evidence from the Permanent Under Secretary of State and the Finance Director at the MoD and we published our Report on the MoD's Annual Report and Accounts in January 2008.

30. Approximately one fifth (£6 billion) of the MoD's budget is spent on the procurement of defence equipment. We are committed to holding an annual defence procurement inquiry, but—in line with the MoD's new focus on through-life equipment costs and the merger of the Defence Procurement Agency and the Defence Logistics Organisation into the Defence Equipment and Support organisation—we are focusing on defence equipment costs through-life rather than on acquisition costs alone.

31. As part of our examination of expenditure, we have also monitored the Departmental Minutes which the MoD has laid before the House of Commons in line with the requirement on Departments to inform the House when they propose to make a gift of a value exceeding £250,000.

### Examination of Public Service Agreements and targets

32. Core Task 6 calls on committees to scrutinise Departments' Public Service Agreements and associated targets.

33. We have held annual inquiries on the MoD's Annual Report and Accounts—the Department's report to Parliament on its performance in each financial year. These inquiries have examined the MoD's performance against its Public Service Agreement (PSA) targets. This has involved taking oral evidence from the Secretary of State, the Permanent Under Secretary of State and the Finance Director at the MoD. We published our Report into the Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006-07<sup>18</sup> in January 2008.

34. The MoD's assessment of its expected achievements against its six Public Service Agreement (PSA) targets, which ran until the end of March 2008, had deteriorated since the previous year's Annual Report and Accounts. At the end of 2007, the MoD did not expect to meet the target relating to generating forces and expected "only partly" to meet targets relating to recruitment and retention, and defence equipment procurement.<sup>19</sup> The ultimate failure to meet the target for generating forces was a consequence of the continuing high levels of deployment of the Armed Forces. We are deeply concerned that, for seven of the last eight years, and for every year since 2002, the Armed Forces have been operating at or above the level of concurrent operations for which they are resourced and structured to deliver.

---

17 National Audit Office, *Performance of the Ministry of Defence 2006-07*, Briefing for the Defence Committee, November 2007. We did not print this evidence in our report, but it is available on our website at: <http://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm200708/cmdefence/memo/ara/ucmara02.pdf>

18 Defence Committee, Fifth Report of Session 2007-08, *Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006-07*, HC 61

19 Ministry of Defence, *Public Service Agreement Report: Quarter 1 2007–2008*

35. We plan to publish our Report into the Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007-08 in early 2009.

### **Scrutiny of Agencies and other associated public bodies**

36. Core Task 7 encourages committees to monitor the work of the Department's Executive Agencies, Non-Departmental Public Bodies (NDPBs) and other associated public bodies.

37. Our scrutiny during the 2007-08 Session was focused on key organisations within the MoD, including Defence Equipment and Support (DE&S). DE&S was formed on 1 April 2007 following the merger of the Defence Procurement Agency (a defence agency) and the Defence Logistics Organisation. DE&S, which spends some £16 billion a year, does not have Agency status. However, given its importance and its level of expenditure, we have undertaken regular inquiries into its activities and performance. We took oral evidence from the Chief of Defence Materiel, head of DE&S, in January 2008 and visited DE&S at Abbey Wood, Bristol, in October 2008. In January 2009 we will begin an inquiry into the Defence Support Group (DSG). DSG is a Trading Fund formed following the merger of ABRO and DARA on 1 April 2008. In addition to Defence Agencies and Trading Funds, the MoD sponsors other bodies including two Public Corporations and five Executive NDPBs. The latter are Service museums with charitable status. We have not yet scrutinised the work of these other sponsored bodies this Parliament.

### **Scrutiny of major appointments**

38. Core Task 8 calls for scrutiny of all major appointments by the Department, envisaging that Departments would notify committees in advance of these appointments.

39. The MoD informs us of key civilian and Service appointments once they had been decided. We monitored all significant appointments to the MoD, its associated agencies and public bodies, as well as to the Armed Forces. To date, we have seen no reason to act upon them. However, we endeavour to hold evidence sessions with new Ministers, senior officials and Service personnel at an early opportunity.

40. Following the departure of Lord Drayson, the Minister for Defence Equipment and Support, in November 2007, we held an evidence session with his successor, the Rt Hon Baroness Taylor of Bolton, on 21 November 2007 as part of our inquiry into the UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty.

41. In January 2008, as part of our annual inquiry into Defence Equipment, we took evidence from General Sir Kevin O'Donoghue, the first Chief of Defence Materiel, who took up his post as head of the new Defence Equipment and Support organisation (DE&S) on 1 April 2007. We also took evidence from Sir Kevin during our current inquiry into Defence Equipment.

42. We have continued to take particular interest in the appointment of the new Service Complaints Commissioner, a position we encouraged the MoD to create in our two Reports on the Armed Forces Bill. We have decided to take evidence from the

Commissioner, Dr Susan Atkins, in the first part of 2009, at the end of her first year in office.

43. Proposals following the publication of the *Governance of Britain* White Paper for involving select committees in public appointments by inviting committees to hold non-binding pre-appointment hearings with nominees for key positions were welcome; but in the case of the Ministry of Defence there were no positions included in the first proposed list. As a Committee we felt that six positions at least be subject to such hearings - those of the Chief of the Defence Staff, the three Service Chiefs, the Chief of Defence Materiel, and the Service Complaints Commissioner. The Department has now conceded one position to which pre-appointment hearings can apply—that of the Service Complaints Commissioner. We hope that there may be some movement from the Ministry of Defence in future in line with practice in other Departments in engaging more proactively with their departmental select committees on this matter.

### **Examination of implementation of legislation and policy initiatives**

44. Core Task 9 encourages committees to examine the implementation of legislation and major policy initiatives, calling on us to develop a framework of progress reports from Departments. We will continue to scrutinise the UK's export control arrangements as part of our involvement in the work of the Committees on Arms Export Controls. We will also continue to take a particular interest in the implementation of the provisions of the Armed Forces Act 2006 which is carried out by means of secondary legislation.

### **Production of reports for debate**

45. Core Task 10 calls for committees to produce Reports which are suitable for debate in the House, including Westminster Hall and debating Committees.

46. Our Reports on *UK land operations in Iraq* and *The future of NATO and European defence* were 'tagged' on the Order Paper as relevant to the general debate in the House on Defence in the World on 8 May. The House held a general debate on Defence Procurement on 19 June, and on that occasion, our Reports on *Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006-07* and *Defence Equipment 2008* were tagged as relevant. Our Report on *Medical care for the Armed Forces* was debated in Westminster Hall on 17 July.

## 3 Working Practices and Innovation

---

### Extending our range of witnesses

47. Although we have taken evidence from Ministers and officials at the MoD as part of all of our inquiries, our evidence-taking from Government was not limited to the Ministry of Defence. As part of our inquiry into *Medical care for the Armed Forces* we took evidence from the Minister of State for Health Services at the Department of Health. We have also taken evidence from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office in our inquiry into the *future of NATO and European Defence*, and on our single evidence session on *Iraq and Afghanistan*, held jointly with the Foreign Affairs Committee, with the Defence and Foreign Secretaries in October 2008. As part of our inquiry into the *UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty*, we took oral evidence from the Cabinet Office as well as from the MoD. We took oral evidence from the Home Office and Cabinet Office as part of our inquiry into *UK national security and resilience*. A complete list of witnesses and oral evidence sessions is provided in Annex 3. We also took evidence from the Scottish Executive and NHS Trusts in relation to our inquiry into medical care.

### Webfora

48. We held a webforum as part of our inquiry into *Medical care for the Armed Forces*. This was the first Committee webforum hosted internally by the House of Commons.<sup>20</sup> It sought to obtain the personal views of Service personnel and others who may not wish to contribute formal evidence to our inquiries. We ran this webforum in two stages either side of the Parliamentary summer recess. We received in excess of 150 postings from people who had registered. Following on from this success, we decided to host a webforum during our inquiry into *Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel*. The forum ran between 2 April 2008 and 28 May 2008 and attracted 13,785 views (7,271 views in most popular thread), 184 posts and 226 registrations.

49. Each webforum provided us with an opportunity to respond to comments posted on the forum and for contributors in turn to respond to our comments. We believe it was a useful way of engaging public interest in our inquiries and of furthering well-informed debate on defence matters. It also extended the scope of our inquiry by allowing us to hear the views of those who might not otherwise have made representations to a select committee.

### Publication of evidence on the internet

50. We have continued to publish memoranda received during the course of our inquiries on our website rather than waiting until the relevant Report was published. We believe it to be important in encouraging debate and stimulating a greater response to our calls for evidence. We have also agreed to publish the Government responses to our Reports on the internet in order make them available to the public as quickly as possible before considering whether to print them as Special Reports.

---

<sup>20</sup> Our 2006 webforum was hosted by the Hansard Society, as had been the practice with previous such operations.

## Seminars

51. As we explained in our previous Reports on the work of the Committee, the list of the formal activities of the Committee gives only a partial picture of the work that we do. Formal evidence naturally forms the backbone of our work and underpins our inquiries. However, we have also held a number of informal seminars in addition to a large number of informal meetings with visiting delegations.

52. We received confidential briefings from the MoD on the UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty and on the Fulton Report into the Iran hostages incident. During a seminar, which we held at the Defence Academy at Shrivenham, we reflected critically on our performance to date, identified areas where we can further improve our working practices, and established our priorities for the year ahead. A list of our seminars and informal briefings is set out in Annex 4.

## Inward visits

53. During the course of the year we also met a large number of foreign delegations. We hosted meetings with delegations of MPs from the Parliaments of Afghanistan, Germany, Poland, Georgia, France, The Czech Republic, Pakistan and Bosnia-Herzegovina. We also met government ministers from Columbia and Albania. In addition, we held informal meetings with Ambassador Francesc Vendrell, the EU Special Representative to Afghanistan and with the German Parliamentary Commissioner for the Armed Forces. A list of our meetings with inward visitors is listed in Annex 4.

## Outward visits

54. We again visited UK Forces on deployment in both Iraq and Afghanistan. **We believe that visiting our troops wherever they are deployed is crucial to our understanding of the conditions in which our Armed Forces operate.** We visited Iraq via Bahrain and the Northern Gulf in June as part of our inquiry into *The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned*. In Bahrain, we visited Coalition Maritime Component Command and met both the US Naval Central Commander, and the UK Deputy Commander. We also visited Royal Naval ships in the Northern Gulf operation as part of Combined Task Force 158 whose primary mission was to maintain security around the al-Basra Oil Terminal (ABOT) and the Khawr al-Amaya Oil Terminal (KAAOT). In Iraq we visited the UK-Led Naval Training Team (NaTT) based within the Iraqi Navy compound in Umm Qasr, UK Forces and local politicians at the Contingency Operating Base at Basra Air Station and Military Transition Teams (MiTTs) embedded with the Iraqi units which they are training outside the COB. As noted above, the very positive developments we saw in Iraq prompted the publication of our Report, *UK operations in Iraq and the Gulf*.

55. In July, we decided to travel to Afghanistan via Pakistan where we held discussions with senior Pakistani government and military representatives in Islamabad. In Afghanistan, we met UK Forces and officials, Afghan politicians and journalists in Kabul, and UK Forces, local politicians and Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) in Camp Bastion and Lashkar Gah, in Helmand Province, Southern Afghanistan. We also were able to travel to the Bost Hotel in Lashkar Gah to meet the Governor of Helmand and Provincial Council Members.

56. As in 2007, we continued our visits to defence establishments in the UK. Individual Members visited several Ministry of Defence Health Units (MDHUs) around England as part of our inquiry into *Medical care for the Armed Forces*. Individual Members also visited training establishments HMS Raleigh and Army Training Regiment Bassingbourn, and an Armed Forces Careers Information Office in London as part of our inquiry into *Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel*. We also visited Defence Equipment and Support in Abbey Wood as part of our inquiry into *Defence Equipment* and the Ministry of Defence Counter Terrorism Science and Technology Centre at DSTL, Porton Down, as part of our inquiry into *UK national security and resilience*.

## Political engagement within Europe

57. In 2007-08, the Chairman and Mr Crausby attended two meetings of Chairmen of Defence Committees of EU Member States: in Naples in December 2007; and in Paris in October 2008. Our Chairman also represented the Committee at the French Summer Defence Conference in September 2008. Individual Members of the Committee also represented the Committee at various defence conferences and at a training exercise in Europe.

## Petitions

58. In the 2007-08 session, in line with the new procedure, we received copies of petitions to Government calling for more generous policies, and priority in housing, for serving and returning members of the Armed Forces, in recognition of their contribution in Iraq and Afghanistan; calling for the Secretary of State to “honour the covenant between government and service and ex-service personnel” by providing necessary support and medical care; calling for Admiral John Byng to be granted a posthumous pardon; calling for the Ministry of Defence, the Department of Health and other relevant bodies to promote the proposal of Gosport Borough Council, Fareham Borough Council and the Haslar Task Force for the future use of Haslar site for the provision of healthcare services and treatment in Gosport, Fareham and the surrounding areas; and calling for all ex-Gurkha soldiers and their families to be granted British citizenship upon leaving the service. We have decided to take no action on these petitions.

## Specialist Advisers

59. Our work has been greatly assisted by our team of specialist advisers: Paul Beaver, Rear Admiral Richard Cheadle CB DL, Professor Michael Clarke, Major General Timothy Cross CBE, Professor David Kirkpatrick, Dr Andrew Rathmell, Rear Admiral David Snelson CB, and Air Marshal Philip Sturley CB MBE. Dr Sibylle Bauer ably advised the Committees on Arms Export Controls (previously the Quadripartite Committee). Their advice, both directly to the Members of the Committee and to our staff, has been invaluable.

## 4 Departmental Responses

---

60. The MoD continues to respond to all our Reports within, or very shortly after, the two month deadline. Once received, we have this Session agreed to place the responses on our internet page in order to make them available to the House and to the public as quickly as possible before considering whether to print them in Special Reports or to follow up any of their content with the Department. While most of the Government responses we received were subsequently printed as Special Reports in the usual way, the response to our Spring Supplementary Estimates Report was appended to the Main Estimates Report: in addition we asked some further questions of the MoD concerning the response we received. The answers provided by the MoD were also appended to the Main Estimates Report. Our intention in publishing these documents together was to make the continuing dialogue with the Department over Estimates matters—which has been very successful to date—more comprehensible to the reader. We will continue to follow this practice with Estimates Reports and responses when it is appropriate. **We do reiterate what we put in our Annual Report for 2007, that we would like Government responses to deal more fully not just with the content of the recommendations and conclusions of our Reports but also with the evidence and lines of argument that support those recommendations and conclusions.**

## 5 Looking Ahead

---

61. In October 2008 we held a horizon-scanning seminar at the Defence Academy, Shrivenham, to discuss our programme of work for the next year. We were accompanied by our Specialist Advisers, a number of key academics, Ministry of Defence officials, and senior ex-servicemen who were invited to take part in discussions. **We were pleased that the MoD agreed to accommodate us at the Defence Academy and we are grateful to Academy staff at all levels for their assistance in making our seminar a success, and for their valuable contribution to our discussions. We hope very much to make seminars of this sort at Shrivenham an annual event.** As a result of our seminar we issued a press notice announcing our programme of inquiries for the first half of 2009.

62. Our programme for the 2008-09 session starts with the culmination of our inquiries into the *MoD's Annual Report and Accounts 2007-08* and *Defence Equipment*. We then intend to investigate a series of related areas of the MoD's policy and activity in order better to establish: (1) what is the current state of the Armed Forces, in terms of current readiness and capability; and (2) how the MoD must act to ensure that the Armed Forces have the proper training, organisation and capabilities for likely future challenges.

63. The Committee intends to make use of the MoD's Balanced Scorecard, issued with the Defence Plan for 2008-12, to sequence its inquiries throughout the 2008-09 Session and relate them to the MoD's own assessment of its priorities. The MoD's Defence Board uses the Balanced Scorecard to assess Departmental progress: our use of the Balanced Scorecard will enable the Board better to see how our work relates to its own analysis. The Balanced Scorecard will also assist us in ensuring greater focus and relevance for our own assessment of the MoD and the Armed Forces.

64. This series of inquiries will begin in January 2009 with a brief examination of the Defence Support Group (DSG) and the progress made since the amalgamation of ABRO and DARA and the formal launch of the DSG on 1 April 2008. After concluding our current inquiry into *UK national security and resilience*, we will start an inquiry into *Readiness and recuperation for the contingent tasks of today*, which aims to analyse levels of preparedness in the Armed Forces in terms of equipment, manpower, training and sustainability for any new and immediate challenges. We also intend to hold a one-off evidence session with the Service Complaints Commissioner. The next inquiry will be an examination of UK, EU and NATO relations with Russia, which will take account of recent events in the Caucasus within the context of our continuing interest in NATO and ESDP matters. Subsequent inquiries are planned into: current and future helicopter capability; a second assessment of ISTAR issues, with a focus on network-enabled capability (NEC) and the Defence Information Infrastructure (DII); and the strengths and weaknesses of the Comprehensive Approach, drawing on lessons that can be learned from experiences in both Iraq and Afghanistan.

65. We will continue to be ready to react to events as they unfold and adapt our programme as required. We will also continue our core inquiries into the MoD's Main and Supplementary Estimates.

## Conclusions and recommendations

---

1. At our request, the Government extended the period of time available to Parliament to scrutinise the UK/US Defence Trade Co-operation Treaty. This allowed us to conduct an inquiry into the Treaty. We are grateful to the Government for this flexibility. (Paragraph 5)
2. Unusually, because of the classified nature of the material presented to us, we had to conduct our evidence sessions for our inquiry into The Iran hostages incident in private. We had some reservations about conducting scrutiny on terms of the Government's choosing. (Paragraph 12)
3. We concluded that the Fulton Report, and the evidence provided to us in support of it, contained a depth of operational detail which it would have been damaging to have made public. This made it difficult for us to demonstrate openly the grounds on which we reached our conclusions. In our Report, we assured the House that we had scrutinised the Fulton Report thoroughly and we wrote to the Secretary of State for Defence with a number of classified conclusions and recommendations. (Paragraph 14)
4. We believe that visiting our troops wherever they are deployed is crucial to our understanding of the conditions in which our Armed Forces operate. (Paragraph 54)
5. We do reiterate what we put in our Annual Report for 2007, that we would like Government responses to deal more fully not just with the content of the recommendations and conclusions of our Reports but also with the evidence and lines of argument that support those recommendations and conclusions. (Paragraph 60)
6. We were pleased that the MoD agreed to accommodate us at the Defence Academy and we are grateful to Academy staff at all levels for their assistance in making our seminar a success, and for their valuable contribution to our discussions. We hope very much to make seminars of this sort at Shrivenham an annual event. (Paragraph 61)



## Annex 2: Sessional Information

The Committee was nominated by the House of Commons on 13 July 2005.

It had 14 Members and held 46 meetings. These included 1 meeting held concurrently with the Foreign Affairs Committee (abbreviated to (FACM) in the attendance table below) and 6 “Committees on Arms Export Controls” meetings held concurrently with Business and Enterprise, Foreign Affairs, and International Development Committees (abbreviated to (CAEC) in the attendance table below).

<b>Members</b>	<b>Meetings attended</b>
Arbuthnot, Mr James (Chairman)	41 (including 1 FACM and 1 CAEC) out of 46
Borrow, Mr David S	26 (including 1 FACM and 4 CAEC) out of 46
Crausby, Mr David	36 (including 2 CAEC) out of 46
Gilroy, Linda	37 (including 1 FACM and 6 CAEC) out of 46
Hamilton, David	17 out of 46
Hancock, Mr Mike	22 out of 46
Havard, Mr Dai	22 (including 1 FACM) out of 46
Holloway, Mr Adam	26 (including 1 FACM) out of 46
Jenkin, Mr Bernard	40 (including 1 FACM and 4 CAEC) out of 46
Jenkins, Mr Brian	30 out of 46
Jones, Mr Kevan	24 out of 46
Key, Robert	38 (including 1 FACM and 2 CAEC) out of 46
Rennie, Willie (discharged 21.1.08)	10 out of 12
Smith, John	17 out of 46
Younger-Ross, Richard (added 21.1.08)	15 (including 1 FACM) out of 28

### **Overall Attendance:**

**68.2 %<sup>A</sup>**

<sup>A</sup> Not including CAEC meetings.

Total number of meetings:	46
Of which:	
Number of meetings at which oral evidence was taken	22
Number of times oral evidence was taken partly or wholly in private	1
Number of wholly private meetings	17
Number of concurrent meetings with other committees	7

### **Other activities**

Informal meetings (including overseas visitors)	17
Conferences/Seminars hosted	1

### **Staff**

Details of the permanent staff of the Committee during the Session can be found in the Committee's publications.

### **Specialist Advisers during the Session**

Dr Sibylle Bauer\*, Paul Beaver, Rear Admiral Ric Cheadle CB DL, Professor Michael Clarke, Major General Tim Cross CBE, Professor David Kirkpatrick, Dr Andrew Rathmell, Rear Admiral David Snelson and Air Marshal Philip Sturley CB MBE.

\*Specialist Adviser to the Business and Enterprise, Defence, Foreign Affairs, and International Development Committees in their joint inquiry into Strategic Export Controls.

### **Witnesses**

Oral evidence was given during the Session by the following categories of witnesses:

Number of appearances by:

Cabinet Ministers	5
Other Ministers	3
Members of the House of Lords (of whom one was a Minister)	3
Number of appearances by officials from, or representatives of:	
Ministry of Defence	16

Other Government departments comprising:	
Home Office	1
Cabinet Office	1
Department of Health	1
Foreign and Commonwealth Office	2
Appearances by other witnesses	41

**Overseas Visits**

Date	Destination	Members	Staff	Purpose	Cost
15.11.07	Paris, France <sup>A</sup>	Holloway	1	Seminar on Naval Defence	£600.86
16-17.12.07	Naples, Italy <sup>A</sup>	Arbuthnot, Crausby	1	Conference of the Chairmen of Defence Committees of the Member States of the European Union	£2,873.80
2-3.6.08	Brussels, Belgium <sup>A</sup>	Jenkin	0	Conference on NATO in the next decade	£554.51
22-26.6.08	Bahrain and Iraq		1	Inquires into UK operations in Iraq and the Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned	£23,266.38
5-9.7.08	Pakistan and Afghanistan	Arbuthnot, Borrow, Crausby, Havard, Holloway, Jenkin, Jones, Younger-Ross	2	Inquiry into UK operations in Afghanistan	£47,223.38
8-9.9.08	St Malo, France <sup>A</sup>		0	Sixth Summer Defence Conference of the National Defence and Armed Forces Committee of the French National Assembly	£636.80
20-21.9.08	Regensburg, Germany <sup>A</sup>	Jenkins	1	Operation COOP SPIRIT	£1,894.50
26-27.10.08	Paris, France <sup>A</sup>	Arbuthnot, Crausby	1	Conference of the Chairpersons of Defence Committees of the Member States of the European Union	£1,506.00

<sup>A</sup> Travel in a representative capacity

### **Visits to European Institutions**

None.

### **UK Visits**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Destination</b>	<b>Members</b>	<b>Staff</b>	<b>Purpose</b>	<b>Cost</b>
9.11.07	MDHU Frimley Park, Hampshire <sup>A</sup>	Arbuthnot	1	Inquiry into Medical care for the Armed Forces	0
16.11.07	MDHU Portsmouth, Hampshire <sup>A</sup>	Hancock	1	Inquiry into Medical care for the Armed Forces	£15.50
23.11.07	MDHU Northallerton, North Yorkshire <sup>A</sup>	Jones	0	Inquiry into Medical care for the Armed Forces	£34.40
23.11.07	MDHU Derriford, Plymouth, Devon <sup>A</sup>	Gilroy	0	Inquiry into Medical care for the Armed Forces	0
12.2.08	MDHU James Cook University Hospital <sup>A</sup>	Jones	0	Inquiry into Medical care for the Armed Forces	0
24.4.08	Port of Southampton	Borrow, Gilroy	0	Committees on Arms Export Controls	£232.80
29.4.08	Armed Forces Careers Information Office, Holborn, London	Arbuthnot, Borrow, Crausby, Hamilton, Jenkin, Jenkins, Jones, Younger-Ross	2	Inquiry into Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	£97.85
14-15.5.08	AgustaWestland, Yeovil, Somerset	Arbuthnot, Hamilton, Jenkin, Jenkins, Key	2	Familiarisation visit	£1,503.26
19.5.08	HMS Raleigh, Torpoint, Cornwall	Jones	1	Inquiry into Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	£603.00
19.5.08	Army Training Regiment Basingbourn, Cambridgeshire	Arbuthnot	1	Inquiry into Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	£83.32
20.5.08	Salisbury Plain <sup>A</sup>	Jenkin, Jones	1	EU Battlegroup exercise	£614.60

Date	Destination	Members	Staff	Purpose	Cost
14.7.08	Farnborough Air Show	Arbuthnot, Jenkin, Jenkins, Key, Smith	3 <sup>B</sup>	Familiarisation visit	£459.00
1-2.10.08	Defence Equipment & Support, Abbey Wood and Porton Down, Salisbury	Arbuthnot, Gilroy, Jenkin, Jones, Key	3	Familiarisation visit	£1,526.10
15-16.10.08	Defence Academy, Shrivenham	Arbuthnot, Borrow, Crausby, Havard, Holloway, Jenkin, Jenkins, Key, Smith	10 <sup>C</sup>	seminar	£5,000 (estimated outturn)

<sup>A</sup> Travel in a representative capacity

<sup>B</sup> Includes 1 specialist adviser

<sup>C</sup> Includes 4 specialist advisers

#### Reports and Oral and Written Evidence

Title	HC No. (2007–08)	Date of publication	Government reply
First Report: <i>UK land operations in Iraq 2007</i>	110	3.12.07	Received 4.2.08: published as Second Special Report Session 2007–08
Second Report: <i>Costs of operations in Iraq and Afghanistan: Winter Supplementary Estimate 2007-08<sup>A</sup></i>	138	5.12.07	Received 4.3.08
Third Report: <i>UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty</i>	107	11.12.07	Received 21.2.08: published as Third Special Report Session 2007–08
Fourth Report: <i>The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned</i>	181	14.12.07	Received 4.3.08: published as Fourth Special Report Session 2007–08
Fifth Report: <i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006–07</i>	61	28.1.08	Received 28.2.08: published as Fifth Special Report Session 2007–08
Sixth Report: <i>The work of the Committee 2007</i>	274	31.1.08	Not applicable
Seventh Report: <i>Medical care for the Armed Forces</i>	327	18.2.08	Received 22.4.08: published as Sixth Special Report Session 2007–08
Eighth Report: <i>Operational costs in Afghanistan and Iraq: Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007-08<sup>B</sup></i>	400	10.3.08	Received 9.5.08

<b>Title</b>	<b>HC No. (2007–08)</b>	<b>Date of publication</b>	<b>Government reply</b>
Ninth Report: <i>The future of NATO and European Defence</i>	111	20.3.08	Received 14.5.08: published as Eighth Special Report Session 2007–08
Tenth Report: <i>Defence Equipment 2008</i>	295	27.3.08	Received 2.6.08: published as Seventh Special Report Session 2007–08
Eleventh Report: <i>Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2008–09</i>	885	7.7.08	Received 1.10.08: published as Ninth Special Report Session 2007–08
Twelfth Report: <i>Scrutiny of Arms Export Control (2008): UK Strategic Export Controls Annual Report 2006, Quarterly Reports for 2007, licensing policy and review of export control legislation</i>	254	17.7.08	Cm 7485, published 3.11.08
Thirteenth Report: <i>The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability</i>	535	5.8.08	Received 3.10.08: published as Twelfth Special Report Session 2007–08
Fourteenth Report: <i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces Personnel</i>	424	30.7.08	Received 1.10.08: published as Eleventh Special Report Session 2007–08
Fifteenth Report: <i>UK operations in Iraq and the Gulf</i>	982	22.7.08	Received 29.9.08: published as Tenth Special Report Session 2007–08
First Special Report: <i>The work of Defence Estates: Government Response to the Committee's Fifteenth Report of Session 2006–07</i>	109	23.11.07	Not applicable
Second Special Report: <i>UK land operations in Iraq 2007: Government Response to the Committee's First Report of Session 2007–08</i>	352	21.2.08	Not applicable
Third Special Report: <i>UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty: Government Response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2007–08</i>	375	3.3.08	Not applicable
Fourth Special Report: <i>The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned. Government Response to the Committee's Fourth Report of Session 2007–08</i>	399	26.3.08	Not applicable
Fifth Special Report: <i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006–07: Government Response to the Committee's Fifth Report of Session</i>	468	3.4.08	Not applicable

Title	HC No. (2007–08)	Date of publication	Government reply
Sixth Special Report: <i>Medical care for the Armed Forces: Government Response to the Committee's Seventh Report of Session 2007–08</i>	500	9.5.08	Not applicable
Seventh Special Report: <i>Defence Equipment 2008: Government Response to the Committee's Tenth Report of Session 2007–08</i>	555	17.6.08	Not applicable
Eighth Special Report: <i>The future of NATO and European defence: Government Response to the Committee's Ninth Report of Session 2007–08</i>	660	19.6.08	Not applicable
Ninth Special Report: <i>Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2008–09: The Government's Response to the Eleventh Report from the Committee, Session 2007–08</i>	1072	27.10.08	Not applicable
Tenth Special Report: <i>UK operations in Iraq and the Gulf: The Government's Response to the Fifteenth Report from the Committee, Session 2007–08:</i>	1073	29.10.08	Not applicable
Eleventh Special Report: <i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces Personnel: The Government's Response to the Fourteenth Report from the Committee, Session 2007–08:</i>	1074	3.11.08	Not applicable
Twelfth Special Report: <i>The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability: Government response to the Committee's Thirteenth Report of Session 2007–08<sup>c</sup></i>	1087	5.11.08	Not applicable
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>UK national security and resilience</i>	718-i	19.6.08	Not applicable
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>UK national security and resilience</i>	718-ii	27.10.08	Not applicable
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>Iraq and Afghanistan<sup>d</sup></i>	1145-i	3.11.08	Not applicable
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007–08</i>	1168-i	11.11.08	Not applicable
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007–08</i>	1168-ii	18.11.08	Not applicable

<b>Title</b>	<b>HC No. (2007–08)</b>	<b>Date of publication</b>	<b>Government reply</b>
Uncorrected Oral Evidence published on the Internet: <i>Defence Equipment</i>	1198-i	24.11.08	Not applicable
Written Evidence published on the Internet: <i>UK national security and resilience</i>		20.5.08	Not applicable
Written Evidence published on the Internet: <i>Defence Equipment</i>		18.11.08	Not applicable

<sup>A</sup> Government response published as Memorandum in the Committee's Eighth Report (HC 400)

<sup>B</sup> Government response published as Memorandum in the Committee's Eleventh Report (HC 885)

<sup>C</sup> Jointly with the Business and Enterprise, Foreign Affairs and International Development Committees

<sup>D</sup> Jointly with the Foreign Affairs Committee

#### **Government replies to Reports for Session 2006–07**

None.

#### **Formal Minutes**

The Formal Minutes of the Committee were published electronically after each meeting of the Committee. They are available on the Committee's website at <http://www.parliament.uk/defcom>.

#### **Divisions**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Subject</b>
4.3.08	Eight, on consideration of the Chairman's draft Report on <i>The future of NATO and European Defence</i> .

#### **Debates**

Committee reports were debated on 1 occasion in Westminster Hall. Further details can be found in the Committee's Sessional Report.

#### **Number of oral evidence sessions for each inquiry during the Session**

<b>Inquiry</b>	<b>Number of oral evidence sessions</b>
Defence Equipment	3
Iraq and Afghanistan	1
ISTAR	3
Medical care for the Armed Forces	1
Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006–07	2
Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007–08	2
Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	4
The future of NATO and European defence	2
The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned	1
UK national security and resilience	2

<b>Inquiry</b>	<b>Number of oral evidence sessions</b>
UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty	1
Total	22

## Annex 3: Oral Evidence Sessions

### Session 2007–08

Date	Evidence session
13 November 2007	<i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006-07</i> Mr Bill Jeffrey CB, Permanent Under-Secretary of State, and Mr Trevor Woolley CB, Finance Director, Ministry of Defence
20 November 2007	<i>The future of NATO and European Defence</i> General Sir Jack Deverell KCB OBE, Lieutenant-General Sir Rob Fry KCB CBE, Mr Daniel Keohane, and Colonel Christopher Langton OBE
21 November 2007	<i>The UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty</i> Mr Ian Godden, Secretary, Defence Industries Council, and Chief Executive Officer, Society of British Aerospace Companies, Mr David Hayes, Chairman, Export Group for Aerospace and Defence, and Director of Export Controls, Dr Jerry McGinn, US Aerospace Industries Association, Dr Sandy Wilson, President and Managing Director, General Dynamics UK, and Ms Alison Wood, Group Strategic Development Director, BAE Systems; Rt Hon Baroness Taylor of Bolton, Minister for Defence Equipment and Support, Mr Stephen French, Director General Acquisition Policy, Mr Tony Pawson, Head of Defence Export Services, and Ms Gloria Craig, Director General International Security Policy, Ministry of Defence, and Mr Paul Lincoln, Head of Defence and Security Policy, Cabinet Office
27 November 2007	<i>Medical Care for the Armed Forces</i> Derek Twigg, a Member of this House, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State, Lieutenant General Robert Baxter CBE, Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff (Health), Lieutenant General Louis Lillywhite MBE QHS, Surgeon-General, Ministry of Defence, Ben Bradshaw, a Member of this House, Minister of State for Health Services, Professor Louis Appleby, Mental Health Clinical Director, and Andrew Cash, Co-Chair, DH/Mod Partnership Board, Department of Health
28 November 2007	<i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006-07</i> Mr Bill Jeffrey CB, Permanent Under-Secretary of State, and Mr Trevor Woolley CB, Finance Director, Ministry of Defence
4 December 2007	<i>The Fulton Report</i> Air Chief Marshal Sir Jock Stirrup GCB AFC ADC RAF, Chief of the Defence Staff, General Sir Timothy Granville-Chapman GBE KCB ADC Gen, Vice Chief of the Defence Staff, Admiral Sir Jonathon Band KCB ADC, First Sea Lord and Chief of the Naval Staff, and Mr Nick Gurr, Director of Communications Planning, Ministry of Defence
8 January 2008	<i>The future of NATO and European Defence</i> Rt Hon Des Browne MP, Secretary of State for Defence, Mr Andrew Mathewson, Director, Policy on International Organisations, Ministry of Defence; Hon Hugh Powell, Head, Security Policy Group, Foreign and Commonwealth Office
29 January 2008	<i>Defence Equipment 2008</i> General Sir Kevin O'Donoghue KCB CBE, Chief of Defence Materiel, David Gould CB, Chief Operating Officer, Defence Equipment & Support, and Lieutenant-General Dick Applegate OBE, Chief of Materiel (Land), Ministry of Defence
25 March 2008	<i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel</i> Professor Christopher Dandeker, King's College London, and Professor Hew Strachan DL, All Souls College, Oxford; Mrs Dawn McCafferty, Chairman, RAF Families Federation, Julie McCarthy, Chief Executive, Army Families Federation, and Mrs Elizabeth Sheldon, Project Director, SSAFA Forces Help
1 April 2008	<i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel</i>

Date	Evidence session
	Tim Corry, Campaigning Director, and Sarah Baxter, National Relationship Manager, SaBRE; Richard Longson, President, and Kieran Gordon, former President, Institute of Career Guidance; Christopher Beese MBE, Chief Administrative Officer, Armor Group, and Chris Sanderson, Director of Government Support, Control Risks
22 April 2008	<i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel</i> Mr Chris Baker OBE, Director General Service Personnel Policy, Air Vice-Marshal Simon Bryant CBE, Chief of Staff (Personnel) and Air Secretary, Major-General Andrew Gregory, Deputy Adjutant-General and Director General Services Conditions (Army), Major-General Simon Lalor TD, Assistant Chief of the Defence Staff (Reserves and Cadets), Rear Admiral Charles Montgomery CBE, Chief of Staff (Personnel) and Naval Secretary, and Vice-Admiral Peter Wilkinson CVO, Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff (Personnel)
6 May 2008	<i>The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability</i> Air Vice-Marshal Simon J. Bollom, Director General Combat Air, Air Vice-Marshal Stuart Butler, Capability Manager (Information Superiority), and Air Vice-Marshal Chris Nickols CBE, Assistant Chief of the Defence Staff (Operations), Ministry of Defence
13 May 2008	<i>The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability</i> Mr David Barnes, Thales UK/UAVS, Mr Simon Jewell, BAE Systems/ Society of British Aerospace Companies, Mr Clive Richardson, QinetiQ/Intellect, and Dr Moira Smith, Waterfall Solutions/DMA
20 May 2008	<i>Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel</i> Mr Derek Twigg MP, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Defence, and Vice-Admiral Peter Wilkinson CVO, Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff (Personnel)
3 June 2008	<i>The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability</i> Mr John Howe CB OBE, Vice-Chairman, Mr Victor Chavez, Vice-President, Business Development, Sales & Marketing, Mr Chris Day, Business Executive, UAV Systems and Mr Nick Miller, Head of UAV Systems Business Development, Thales UK; Mr John Brooks, Vice-President, International Business Development, Mr Graham Thornton, Executive Director, and Colonel Edward Walby USAF (Ret), Director, Business and Strategy Development, Northrop Grumman
17 June 2008	<i>UK national security and resilience</i> Mr Tony Baptiste, Manager (Business Development and Strategy), Fujitsu Defence and Security, Fujitsu, Mr John Higgins CBE, Director-General, Intellect UK, Mr David Livingstone MBE DSC, Managing Partner, Morgan Aquila LLP, Mr Hugo Rosemont, Policy Adviser, Security and Resilience, Society of British Aerospace Companies, and Mr Doug Umbers, Managing Director, VT Communications, VT Group plc
21 October 2008	<i>UK national security and resilience</i> Rt Hon Bob Ainsworth, Minister of State for the Armed Forces, Mr Jon Day CBE, Policy Director, and Brigadier Chip Chapman, Director (Military) Counter-Terrorism and UK Operations, Ministry of Defence, Admiral Lord West of Spithead GCB DSC, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Security and Counter-Terrorism, and Ms Gillian McGregor, Head of Operational Support and Knowledge Management, Office for Security and Counter-Terrorism, Home Office, and Ms Chloe Squires, National Security Secretariat, Cabinet Office
28 October 2008	<i>Iraq and Afghanistan</i> Rt Hon John Hutton MP, Secretary of State for Defence, and Lieutenant-General Peter Wall CBE, Deputy Chief of the Defence Staff (Commitments), Ministry of Defence, and Rt Hon David Miliband MP, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs, and Sir Mark Lyall-Grant KCMG, Director-General, Political Directorate, Foreign and Commonwealth Office
4 November 2008	<i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007-08</i> Sir Bill Jeffrey KCB, Permanent Under Secretary of State, Ministry of Defence, and Mr

Date	Evidence session
	Trevor Woolley CB, Finance Director, Ministry of Defence
12 November 2008	<i>Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2007-08</i> The Rt Hon John Hutton MP, Secretary of State for Defence
18 November 2008	<i>Defence Equipment</i> Mike Turner CBE, Chairman of the Defence Industries Council, Ian Godden, Secretary to the Defence Industries Council and Chief Executive of the Society of British Aerospace Companies, Sandy Wilson, Chairman of the Defence Manufacturers Association, and Bob Keen, Head of Government Relations, BAE Systems
25 November 2008	<i>Defence Equipment</i> General Sir Kevin O'Donoghue KCB CBE, Chief of Defence Materiel, Dr Andrew Tyler, Chief Operating Officer, Defence Equipment and Support and Rear Admiral Paul Lambert CB, Capability Manager (Precision Attack) and Controller of the Navy, Ministry of Defence

## Annex 4: Informal Meetings

### *Meetings with inward visitors*

<b>Meeting</b>	<b>Date</b>
Parliamentary delegation from Afghanistan	13 November 2007
Colombian Minister of Defence	22 November 2007
Ambassador Francesc Vendrell, EU Special Representative to Afghanistan	5 December 2007
NATO Defense College Course 111	12 December 2007
US House Armed Service Committee	10 January 2008
Albanian Minister of Defence	6 March 2008
Danish Defence Commission	6 March 2008
Parliamentary delegation from Germany	17 March 2008
Parliamentary delegation from Poland	16 April 2008
Parliamentary delegation from Georgia	22 April 2008
Delegation from the French Ministry of Foreign Affairs	6 May 2008
Delegation from the China Institute for International Strategic Studies (CISS)	8 May 2008
Parliamentary delegation from France	21 May 2008
Parliamentary delegation from The Czech Republic	4 June 2008
Parliamentary delegation from France	9 June 2008
German Parliamentary Commissioner for the Armed Forces	21 October 2008
Parliamentary delegation from Pakistan	19 November 2008
Parliamentary delegation from Bosnia-Herzegovina	25 November 2008

### *Informal activities held*

<b>Meeting</b>	<b>Date</b>
Briefing from the MoD on the findings of the Fulton Inquiry	20 November 2007
Working practices seminar	15-16 October 2008

## Formal minutes

---

**Tuesday 16 December 2008**

Members present:

Mr James Arbuthnot, in the Chair

Mr David Crausby

Linda Gilroy

Mr Dai Havard

Mr Adam Holloway

Mr Brian Jenkins

Mr Bernard Jenkin

Robert Key

John Smith

Draft Report (*The work of the Committee 2007-08*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

*Ordered*, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 65 read and agreed to.

Annexes and Summary agreed to.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Second Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chairman make the Report to the House.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 13 January at 10.00 am

# List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

---

The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

## Session 2005–06

First Report	Armed Forces Bill	HC 747 (HC 1021)
Second Report	Future Carrier and Joint Combat Aircraft Programmes	HC 554 (HC 926)
Third Report	Delivering Front Line Capability to the RAF	HC 557 (HC 1000)
Fourth Report	Costs of peace-keeping in Iraq and Afghanistan: Spring Supplementary Estimate 2005–06	HC 980 (HC 1136)
Fifth Report	The UK deployment to Afghanistan	HC 558 (HC 1211)
Sixth Report	Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2004–05	HC 822 (HC 1293)
Seventh Report	The Defence Industrial Strategy	HC 824 (HC 1488)
Eighth Report	The Future of the UK's Strategic Nuclear Deterrent: the Strategic Context	HC 986 (HC 1558)
Ninth Report	Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2006–07	HC 1366 (HC 1601)
Tenth Report	The work of the Met Office	HC 823 (HC 1602)
Eleventh Report	Educating Service Children	HC 1054 (HC 58)
Twelfth Report	Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report for 2004, Quarterly Reports for 2005, Licensing Policy and Parliamentary Scrutiny	HC 873 (Cm 6954)
Thirteenth Report	UK Operations in Iraq	HC 1241 (HC 1603)
Fourteenth Report	Armed Forces Bill: proposal for a Service Complaints Commissioner	HC 1711 (HC 180)

## Session 2006–07

First Report	Defence Procurement 2006	HC 56 (HC 318)
Second Report	Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2005–06	HC 57 (HC 376)
Third Report	Costs of operations in Iraq and Afghanistan: Winter Supplementary Estimate 2006–07	HC 129 (HC 317)
Fourth Report	The Future of the UK's Strategic Nuclear Deterrent: the Manufacturing and Skills Base	HC 59 (HC 304)
Fifth Report	The work of the Committee in 2005 and 2006	HC 233 (HC 344)
Sixth Report	The Defence Industrial Strategy: update	HC 177 (HC 481)
Seventh Report	The Army's requirement for armoured vehicles: the FRES programme	HC 159 (HC 511)
Eighth Report	The work of the Defence Science and Technology Laboratory and the funding of defence research	HC 84 (HC 512)
Ninth Report	The Future of the UK's Strategic Nuclear Deterrent: the White Paper	HC 225–I and –II (HC 551)
Tenth Report	Cost of military operations: Spring Supplementary Estimate 2006–07	HC 379 (HC 558)

Eleventh Report	Strategic Lift	HC 462 (HC1025)
Twelfth Report	Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2007–08	HC 835 (HC 1026)
Thirteenth Report	UK operations in Afghanistan	HC 408 (HC 1024)
Fourteenth Report	Strategic Export Controls: 2007 Review	HC 117 (Cm 7260)
Fifteenth Report	The work of Defence Estates	HC 535 (HC 109)

### Session 2007–08

First Report	UK land operations in Iraq 2007	HC 110 (HC 352)
Second Report	Costs of operations in Iraq and Afghanistan: Winter Supplementary Estimate 2007–08	HC 138 <sup>A</sup>
Third Report	UK/US Defence Trade Cooperation Treaty	HC 107 (HC 375)
Fourth Report	The Iran hostages incident: the lessons learned	HC 181 (HC 399)
Fifth Report	Ministry of Defence Annual Report and Accounts 2006–07	HC 61 (HC 468)
Sixth Report	The work of the Committee in 2007	HC 274
Seventh Report	Medical care for the Armed Forces	HC 327 (HC 500)
Eighth Report	Operational costs in Afghanistan and Iraq: Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007–08	HC 400 <sup>B</sup>
Ninth Report	The future of NATO and European defence	HC 111 (HC 660)
Tenth Report	Defence Equipment 2008	HC 295 (HC 555)
Eleventh Report	Ministry of Defence Main Estimates 2008–09	HC 885 (HC 1072)
Twelfth Report	Scrutiny of Arms Export controls (2008): UK Strategic Export Controls Annual Report 2006, Quarterly Reports for 2007, licensing policy and review of export control legislation	HC 254
Thirteen Report	The contribution of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles to ISTAR capability	HC 535 (HC 1087)
Fourteenth Report	Recruiting and retaining Armed Forces personnel	HC 424 (HC 1074)
Fifteenth Report	UK operations in Iraq and the Gulf	HC 982 (HC 1073)

<sup>A</sup> Government response published as Memorandum in the Committee's Eighth Report (HC 400)

<sup>B</sup> Government response published as Memorandum in the Committee's Eleventh Report (HC 885)

### Session 2008–09

First Report	Winter Supplementary Estimates 2007–08	HC 52
--------------	--	-------